Farey sequence and Graham's conjectures

Szymon Salabura

1st December 2022

Notation:

- \bullet (a, b) greatest common divisor of a and b
- [a, b] least common multiple of a and b

Definition. (Farey sequence)

Definition. (Farey sequence)

$$\bullet \ F_1 = \left\{ \frac{0}{1}, \frac{1}{1} \right\}$$

Definition. (Farey sequence)

- $F_1 = \left\{ \frac{0}{1}, \frac{1}{1} \right\}$
- $F_2 = \left\{ \frac{0}{1}, \frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{1} \right\}$

Definition. (Farey sequence)

- $F_1 = \left\{ \frac{0}{1}, \frac{1}{1} \right\}$
- $F_2 = \left\{ \frac{0}{1}, \frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{1} \right\}$
- $\bullet \ F_3 = \left\{ \frac{0}{1}, \frac{1}{3}, \frac{1}{2}, \frac{2}{3}, \frac{1}{1} \right\}$

Definition. (Farey sequence)

- $F_1 = \left\{ \frac{0}{1}, \frac{1}{1} \right\}$
- $F_2 = \left\{ \frac{0}{1}, \frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{1} \right\}$
- $F_3 = \left\{ \frac{0}{1}, \frac{1}{3}, \frac{1}{2}, \frac{2}{3}, \frac{1}{1} \right\}$
- $F_4 = \left\{ \frac{0}{1}, \frac{1}{4}, \frac{1}{3}, \frac{1}{2}, \frac{2}{3}, \frac{3}{4}, \frac{1}{1} \right\}$

Definition. (Farey sequence)

- $F_1 = \left\{ \frac{0}{1}, \frac{1}{1} \right\}$
- $F_2 = \left\{ \frac{0}{1}, \frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{1} \right\}$
- $F_3 = \left\{ \frac{0}{1}, \frac{1}{3}, \frac{1}{2}, \frac{2}{3}, \frac{1}{1} \right\}$
- $F_4 = \left\{ \frac{0}{1}, \frac{1}{4}, \frac{1}{3}, \frac{1}{2}, \frac{2}{3}, \frac{3}{4}, \frac{1}{1} \right\}$
- $\bullet \ F_5 = \left\{ \frac{0}{1}, \frac{1}{5}, \frac{1}{4}, \frac{1}{3}, \frac{2}{5}, \frac{1}{2}, \frac{3}{5}, \frac{2}{3}, \frac{3}{4}, \frac{4}{5}, \frac{1}{1} \right\}$

Definition. (Farey sequence)

- $F_1 = \left\{ \frac{0}{1}, \frac{1}{1} \right\}$
- $F_2 = \left\{ \frac{0}{1}, \frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{1} \right\}$
- $F_3 = \left\{ \frac{0}{1}, \frac{1}{3}, \frac{1}{2}, \frac{2}{3}, \frac{1}{1} \right\}$
- $F_4 = \left\{ \frac{0}{1}, \frac{1}{4}, \frac{1}{3}, \frac{1}{2}, \frac{2}{3}, \frac{3}{4}, \frac{1}{1} \right\}$
- $\bullet \ F_5 = \left\{ \frac{0}{1}, \frac{1}{5}, \frac{1}{4}, \frac{1}{3}, \frac{2}{5}, \frac{1}{2}, \frac{3}{5}, \frac{2}{3}, \frac{3}{4}, \frac{4}{5}, \frac{1}{1} \right\}$
- $F_6 = \left\{ \frac{0}{1}, \frac{1}{6}, \frac{1}{5}, \frac{1}{4}, \frac{1}{3}, \frac{2}{5}, \frac{1}{2}, \frac{3}{5}, \frac{2}{3}, \frac{3}{4}, \frac{4}{5}, \frac{5}{6}, \frac{1}{1} \right\}$



Definition.

$$Q(S) = \left\{ \frac{x}{y} : x, y \in S, x \leqslant y \text{ and } y \neq 0 \right\}.$$

Definition.

$$Q(S) = \left\{ \frac{x}{y} : x, y \in S, x \leqslant y \text{ and } y \neq 0 \right\}.$$

$$S = \left\{0, \frac{1}{4}, \frac{3}{5}, \frac{2}{3}\right\}$$

Definition.

$$Q(S) = \left\{ \frac{x}{y} : x, y \in S, x \leqslant y \text{ and } y \neq 0 \right\}.$$

$$S = \left\{0, \frac{1}{4}, \frac{3}{5}, \frac{2}{3}\right\}$$

$$\mathcal{Q}(S) = \left\{0, \frac{3}{8}, \frac{5}{12}, \frac{9}{10}, 1\right\}$$

Definition.

$$Q(S) = \left\{ \frac{x}{y} : x, y \in S, x \leqslant y \text{ and } y \neq 0 \right\}.$$

$$S = \left\{0, \frac{1}{4}, \frac{1}{3}, \frac{1}{2}, 1\right\}$$

Definition.

$$\mathcal{Q}(S) = \left\{ \frac{x}{y} : x, y \in S, x \leqslant y \text{ and } y \neq 0 \right\}.$$

$$S = \left\{0, \frac{1}{4}, \frac{1}{3}, \frac{1}{2}, 1\right\}$$

$$\Downarrow$$

$$Q(S) = \left\{0, \frac{1}{4}, \frac{1}{3}, \frac{1}{2}, \frac{2}{3}, \frac{3}{4}, 1\right\} = F_4$$

Definition.

For any set S of real numbers, we define

$$Q(S) = \left\{ \frac{x}{y} : x, y \in S, x \leqslant y \text{ and } y \neq 0 \right\}.$$

$$S = \left\{0, \frac{1}{4}, \frac{1}{3}, \frac{1}{2}, 1\right\}$$

$$\mathcal{Q}(S) = \left\{0, \frac{1}{4}, \frac{1}{3}, \frac{1}{2}, \frac{2}{3}, \frac{3}{4}, 1\right\} = F_4$$

We are mainly interested in sets $S \subseteq F_n$, such that $Q(S) \subseteq F_n$ for some n.

Conjecture 1.

Let a_1, a_2, \ldots, a_n be distinct positive integers, we have

$$\max_{i,j} \frac{a_i}{(a_i, a_j)} \geqslant n$$

Conjecture 1.

Let a_1, a_2, \ldots, a_n be distinct positive integers, we have

$$\max_{i,j} \frac{a_i}{(a_i, a_j)} \geqslant n$$

For example, for a = (4, 6, 8, 12) we have

$$\max_{i,j} \frac{a_i}{(a_i, a_j)} = \frac{8}{(8, 6)} = \frac{8}{2} = 4 \geqslant 4$$

Conjecture 1.

Let a_1, a_2, \ldots, a_n be distinct positive integers, we have

$$\max_{i,j} \frac{a_i}{(a_i, a_j)} \geqslant n$$

- $\exists_i a_i$ is prime Winterle (1970)
- n = p + 1 Vélez (1977)
- n = p Szemerédi (1977)
- $\exists_{i,p>(n-1)/2} p \mid a_i$ Boyle (1977)
- sufficiently large *n* Szegedy, Zaharescu (1986-87)
- general case Balasubramanian, Soundararajan (1996)

Let $M_n = lcm(1, 2, \ldots, n)$.

Conjecture 2.

Let $a_1 < a_2 < \cdots < a_n$ be distinct positive integers,

$$gcd(a_1, a_2, \ldots, a_n) = 1$$

and

$$\max_{i,j} \frac{a_i}{(a_i,a_j)} = n.$$

Then $\{a_1, a_2, \ldots, a_n\}$ can only be $\{1, 2, \ldots, n\}$ or $\left\{\frac{M_n}{n}, \frac{M_n}{n-1}, \ldots, \frac{M_n}{1}\right\}$ except for n = 4, where we have the additional sequence $\{2, 3, 4, 6\}$.

Let $M_n = lcm(1, 2, \ldots, n)$.

Conjecture 2.

Let $a_1 < a_2 < \cdots < a_n$ be distinct positive integers,

$$gcd(a_1, a_2, \ldots, a_n) = 1$$

and

$$\max_{i,j}\frac{a_i}{(a_i,a_j)}=n.$$

Then $\{a_1, a_2, \ldots, a_n\}$ can only be $\{1, 2, \ldots, n\}$ or $\left\{\frac{M_n}{n}, \frac{M_n}{n-1}, \ldots, \frac{M_n}{1}\right\}$ except for n = 4, where we have the additional sequence $\{2, 3, 4, 6\}$.

- sufficiently large n Szegedy, Zaharescu (1986-87)
- $n > 10^{50000}$ Cheng, Pomerance (1994)
- general case Balasubramanian, Soundararajan (1996)

Conjecture 1.

Let a_1, a_2, \ldots, a_n be distinct positive integers, we have

$$\max_{i,j} \frac{a_i}{(a_i, a_j)} \geqslant n$$

We get the following result from Conjecture 1.

Theorem 1.

Suppose $S \subseteq F_n$, if $Q(S) \subseteq F_n$, the S has at most n+1 elements.

Conjecture 1.

Let a_1, a_2, \ldots, a_n be distinct positive integers, we have

$$\max_{i,j} \frac{a_i}{(a_i, a_j)} \geqslant n$$

We get the following result from Conjecture 1.

Theorem 1.

Suppose $S \subseteq F_n$, if $Q(S) \subseteq F_n$, the S has at most n+1 elements.

In fact, the above theorem is equivalent to Conjecture 1.

Theorem 2.

Conjecture 1 is equivalent to Theorem 1.

Theorem 1.

Suppose $S \subseteq F_n$, if $Q(S) \subseteq F_n$, the S has at most n+1 elements.

Theorem 1.

Suppose $S \subseteq F_n$, if $Q(S) \subseteq F_n$, the S has at most n+1 elements.

We prove by contradiction.

Suppose there is a subset $S \subseteq F_n$ such that $\mathcal{Q}(S) \subseteq F_n$, but $|S| \ge n + 2$.

Then $S' = S \setminus \{0\}$ has at least n+1 distinct elements x_k/y_k with

$$(x_k,y_k)=1.$$

$$\frac{x_1}{y_1} < \frac{x_2}{y_2} < \dots < \frac{x_n}{y_n} < \frac{1}{1}$$

Theorem 1.

Suppose $S \subseteq F_n$, if $\mathcal{Q}(S) \subseteq F_n$, the S has at most n+1 elements.

$$\frac{x_1}{y_1} < \frac{x_2}{y_2} < \dots < \frac{x_n}{y_n} < \frac{1}{1}$$

Let
$$a_{n+1}=[x_1,\ldots,x_n]$$
, $a_k=a_{n+1}\cdot \frac{y_k}{x_k}$.

$$a_{n+1} \cdot \frac{y_1}{x_1} > a_{n+1} \cdot \frac{y_2}{x_2} > \dots > a_{n+1} \cdot \frac{y_n}{x_n} > a_{n+1}$$

$$a_1 > a_2 > \cdots > a_n > a_{n+1}$$

$$(a_i, a_j) = \left(a_{n+1} \cdot \frac{y_i}{x_i}, a_{n+1} \cdot \frac{y_j}{x_j}\right)$$

$$= \frac{a_{n+1}}{[x_i, x_j]} \cdot (y_i, y_j) \left(\frac{[x_i, x_j]}{x_i} \cdot \frac{y_i}{(y_i, y_j)}, \frac{[x_i, x_j]}{x_j} \cdot \frac{y_j}{(y_i, y_j)}\right)$$

$$(a_i, a_j) = \frac{a_{n+1}}{[x_i, x_j]} \cdot (y_i, y_j) \left(\frac{[x_i, x_j]}{x_i} \cdot \frac{y_i}{(y_i, y_j)}, \frac{[x_i, x_j]}{x_j} \cdot \frac{y_j}{(y_i, y_j)} \right)$$

$$(a_i, a_j) = \frac{a_{n+1}}{[x_i, x_j]} \cdot (y_i, y_j) \left(\frac{[x_i, x_j]}{x_i} \cdot \frac{y_i}{(y_i, y_j)}, \frac{[x_i, x_j]}{x_j} \cdot \frac{y_j}{(y_i, y_j)} \right)$$

$$(a_i, a_j) = \frac{a_{n+1}}{[x_i, x_j]} \cdot (y_i, y_j) \left(\frac{[x_i, x_j]}{x_i} \cdot \frac{y_i}{(y_i, y_j)}, \frac{[x_i, x_j]}{x_j} \cdot \frac{y_j}{(y_i, y_j)} \right)$$

$$\bullet \left(\frac{[x_i,x_j]}{x_i},\frac{[x_i,x_j]}{x_j}\right) = 1$$

$$(a_i, a_j) = \frac{a_{n+1}}{[x_i, x_j]} \cdot (y_i, y_j) \left(\frac{[x_i, x_j]}{x_i} \cdot \frac{y_i}{(y_i, y_j)}, \frac{[x_i, x_j]}{x_j} \cdot \frac{y_j}{(y_i, y_j)} \right)$$

$$\bullet \ \left(\frac{[x_i,x_j]}{x_i},\frac{[x_i,x_j]}{x_j}\right)=1$$

$$\bullet \left(\frac{y_i}{(y_i,y_j)},\frac{y_j}{(y_i,y_j)}\right) = 1$$

$$(a_i, a_j) = \frac{a_{n+1}}{[x_i, x_j]} \cdot (y_i, y_j) \left(\frac{[x_i, x_j]}{x_i} \cdot \frac{y_i}{(y_i, y_j)}, \frac{[x_i, x_j]}{x_j} \cdot \frac{y_j}{(y_i, y_j)} \right)$$

- $ullet \left(rac{[x_i,x_j]}{x_i},rac{[x_i,x_j]}{x_j}
 ight)=1$
- $\bullet \ \left(\frac{y_i}{(y_i,y_j)},\frac{y_j}{(y_i,y_j)}\right) = 1$
- $\bullet \ \frac{[x_i,x_j]}{x_i} \mid x_j \wedge \frac{y_j}{(y_i,y_j)} \mid y_j \wedge (x_j,y_j) = 1 \implies \left(\frac{[x_i,x_j]}{x_i},\frac{y_j}{(y_i,y_j)}\right) = 1$

$$(a_i, a_j) = \frac{a_{n+1}}{[x_i, x_j]} \cdot (y_i, y_j) \left(\frac{[x_i, x_j]}{x_i} \cdot \frac{y_i}{(y_i, y_j)}, \frac{[x_i, x_j]}{x_j} \cdot \frac{y_j}{(y_i, y_j)} \right)$$

- $\bullet \ \left(\frac{[x_i,x_j]}{x_i},\frac{[x_i,x_j]}{x_j}\right) = 1$
- $\bullet \left(\frac{y_i}{(y_i,y_j)},\frac{y_j}{(y_i,y_j)}\right) = 1$
- $\bullet \ \frac{[x_i,x_j]}{x_i} \mid x_j \wedge \frac{y_j}{(y_i,y_j)} \mid y_j \wedge (x_j,y_j) = 1 \implies \left(\frac{[x_i,x_j]}{x_i},\frac{y_j}{(y_i,y_j)}\right) = 1$
- $\bullet \ \ \frac{y_i}{(y_i,y_j)} \mid y_i \wedge \frac{[x_i,x_j]}{x_j} \mid x_i \wedge (x_i,y_i) = 1 \implies \left(\frac{y_i}{(y_i,y_j)},\frac{[x_i,x_j]}{x_j}\right) = 1$

$$(a_i, a_j) = \frac{a_{n+1}}{[x_i, x_j]} \cdot (y_i, y_j) \left(\frac{[x_i, x_j]}{x_i} \cdot \frac{y_i}{(y_i, y_j)}, \frac{[x_i, x_j]}{x_j} \cdot \frac{y_j}{(y_i, y_j)} \right)$$

Note that the g.c.d. part equals 1, because

$$\bullet \ \left(\frac{[x_i,x_j]}{x_i},\frac{[x_i,x_j]}{x_j}\right)=1$$

$$\bullet \left(\frac{y_i}{(y_i,y_j)},\frac{y_j}{(y_i,y_j)}\right) = 1$$

$$\bullet \ \ \frac{[x_i,x_j]}{x_i} \mid x_j \wedge \frac{y_j}{(y_i,y_j)} \mid y_j \wedge (x_j,y_j) = 1 \ \Longrightarrow \ \left(\frac{[x_i,x_j]}{x_i},\frac{y_j}{(y_i,y_j)}\right) = 1$$

$$\bullet \ \frac{y_i}{(y_i,y_j)} \mid y_i \wedge \frac{[x_i,x_j]}{x_j} \mid x_i \wedge (x_i,y_i) = 1 \implies \left(\frac{y_i}{(y_i,y_j)},\frac{[x_i,x_j]}{x_j}\right) = 1$$

Hence

$$(a_i,a_j)=\frac{a_{n+1}}{[x_i,x_i]}(y_i,y_j)$$

For j = n + 1:

$$(a_i, a_{n+1}) = \left(\frac{a_{n+1}}{x_i}y_i, \frac{a_{n+1}}{x_i}x_i\right) = \frac{a_{n+1}}{x_i}$$

For j = n + 1:

$$(a_i, a_{n+1}) = \left(\frac{a_{n+1}}{x_i}y_i, \frac{a_{n+1}}{x_i}x_i\right) = \frac{a_{n+1}}{x_i}$$

We can therefore extend previous result to $1 \le i < j \le n+1$.

$$(a_i, a_j) = \frac{a_{n+1}}{[x_i, x_j]}(y_i, y_j)$$

and

$$\frac{a_i}{(a_i, a_j)} = \frac{a_i}{a_{n+1}} \cdot \frac{[x_i, x_j]}{(y_i, y_j)} = \frac{y_i}{x_i} \cdot \frac{[x_i, x_j]}{(y_i, y_j)}$$

On the other hand,

$$\frac{x_i}{y_i}/\frac{x_j}{y_j} = \frac{x_i y_j}{x_j y_i} = \frac{x_i}{(x_i, x_j)} \cdot \frac{y_j}{(y_i, y_j)} / \left(\frac{x_j}{(x_i, x_j)} \cdot \frac{y_i}{(y_i, y_j)}\right)$$

On the other hand,

$$\frac{x_i}{y_i}/\frac{x_j}{y_j} = \frac{x_i y_j}{x_j y_i} = \frac{x_i}{(x_i, x_j)} \cdot \frac{y_j}{(y_i, y_j)} / \left(\frac{x_j}{(x_i, x_j)} \cdot \frac{y_i}{(y_i, y_j)}\right)$$

Theorem 1.

Suppose $S \subseteq F_n$, if $Q(S) \subseteq F_n$, the S has at most n+1 elements.

The fraction in the right side is in its lowest term and since $Q(S') \subseteq F_n$, we have

$$\frac{x_j}{(x_i, x_j)} \cdot \frac{y_i}{(y_i, y_j)} \leqslant n$$

$$\frac{[x_i, x_j]}{x_i} \cdot \frac{y_i}{(y_i, y_i)} \leqslant n$$

For $1 \le i < j \le n + 1$:

$$\frac{a_i}{(a_i,a_j)} = \frac{y_i}{x_i} \cdot \frac{[x_i,x_j]}{(y_i,y_j)}$$

$$\frac{[x_i, x_j]}{x_i} \cdot \frac{y_i}{(y_i, y_j)} \leqslant n$$

$$\frac{a_i}{(a_i,a_j)}\leqslant n$$

This contradicts Conjecture 1.

Conjecture 1.

Let a_1, a_2, \ldots, a_n be distinct positive integers, we have

$$\max_{i,j} \frac{a_i}{(a_i, a_i)} \geqslant n$$

Theorem 2.

Conjecture 1 is equivalent to Theorem 1.

Theorem 2.

Conjecture 1 is equivalent to Theorem 1.

We have already shown that Conjecture 1 implies Theorem 1. Now we assume Theorem 1 and give a proof by contradiction of Conjecture 1.

Let a_1, a_2, \ldots, a_n be distinct positive integers, we have

$$\max_{i,j} \frac{a_i}{(a_i, a_j)} \geqslant n$$

Suppose there are n+1 distinct positive integers $a_1 < a_2 < \cdots < a_{n+1}$ such that

$$\max_{i,j} \frac{a_i}{(a_i, a_j)} \leqslant n$$

Let a_1, a_2, \ldots, a_n be distinct positive integers, we have

$$\max_{i,j} \frac{a_i}{(a_i, a_j)} \geqslant n$$

Suppose there are n+1 distinct positive integers $a_1 < a_2 < \cdots < a_{n+1}$ such that

$$\max_{i,j} \frac{a_i}{(a_i, a_j)} \leqslant n$$

Let a_1, a_2, \ldots, a_n be distinct positive integers, we have

$$\max_{i,j} \frac{a_i}{(a_i, a_j)} \geqslant n$$

Suppose there are n+1 distinct positive integers $a_1 < a_2 < \cdots < a_{n+1}$ such that

$$\max_{i,j} \frac{a_i}{(a_i, a_j)} \leqslant n$$

$$(x_k, y_k) = 1$$

Let a_1, a_2, \ldots, a_n be distinct positive integers, we have

$$\max_{i,j} \frac{a_i}{(a_i, a_j)} \geqslant n$$

Suppose there are n+1 distinct positive integers $a_1 < a_2 < \cdots < a_{n+1}$ such that

$$\max_{i,j} \frac{a_i}{(a_i, a_j)} \leqslant n$$

- $(x_k, y_k) = 1$
- $\frac{x_k}{y_k} = \frac{a_1}{a_k}$ are distinct reduced fractions

Let a_1, a_2, \ldots, a_n be distinct positive integers, we have

$$\max_{i,j} \frac{a_i}{(a_i, a_j)} \geqslant n$$

Suppose there are n+1 distinct positive integers $a_1 < a_2 < \cdots < a_{n+1}$ such that

$$\max_{i,j} \frac{a_i}{(a_i, a_j)} \leqslant n$$

- $(x_k, y_k) = 1$
- $\frac{x_k}{y_k} = \frac{a_1}{a_k}$ are distinct reduced fractions
- $x_k \leqslant y_k \leqslant n$

Let a_1, a_2, \ldots, a_n be distinct positive integers, we have

$$\max_{i,j} \frac{a_i}{(a_i, a_j)} \geqslant n$$

Suppose there are n+1 distinct positive integers $a_1 < a_2 < \cdots < a_{n+1}$ such that

$$\max_{i,j} \frac{a_i}{(a_i, a_j)} \leqslant n$$

- $(x_k, y_k) = 1$
- $\frac{x_k}{y_k} = \frac{a_1}{a_k}$ are distinct reduced fractions
- $x_k \leqslant y_k \leqslant n$
- $\frac{x_k}{y_k} \in F_n$



Thus $S = \left\{0, \frac{x_1}{y_1}, \frac{x_2}{y_2}, \dots, \frac{x_{n+1}}{y_{n+1}}\right\}$ is a subset of F_n .

Thus $S = \left\{0, \frac{x_1}{y_1}, \frac{x_2}{y_2}, \dots, \frac{x_{n+1}}{y_{n+1}}\right\}$ is a subset of F_n .

But also for every $i \leqslant j$, $\frac{x_i}{y_i} \geqslant \frac{x_j}{y_i}$ we have

$$\frac{x_j}{y_j} / \frac{x_i}{y_i} = \frac{a_1 / a_j}{a_1 / a_i} = \frac{a_i}{a_j} = \frac{a_i / (a_i, a_j)}{a_j / (a_i, a_j)} \in F_n$$

$$\max_{i,j} \frac{a_i}{(a_i, a_i)} \leqslant n$$

$$S = \left\{0, \frac{x_1}{y_1}, \frac{x_2}{y_2}, \dots, \frac{x_{n+1}}{y_{n+1}}\right\}$$

$$\forall_{x,y\in S,x\leqslant y,y\neq 0}\,\frac{x}{y}\in F_n$$

Thus $Q(S) \subseteq F_n$, but $|S| \ge n + 2$, which contradicts Theorem 1.

Theorem 1.

Suppose $S \subseteq F_n$, if $Q(S) \subseteq F_n$, the S has at most n+1 elements.



Theorem 3.

Suppose $S \subseteq F_n$, |S| = n + 1 and $Q(S) \subseteq F_n$, then S can only be one of the following sets:

- $S = \left\{0, 1, \frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{3}, \dots, \frac{1}{n}\right\}$
- $S = \left\{0, 1, \frac{1}{n}, \frac{2}{n}, \dots, \frac{n-1}{n}\right\}$
- $S = \left\{0, 1, \frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{3}, \frac{2}{3}\right\}$ for n = 4

The result is based on Graham's second conjecture.

Theorem 4.

Suppose $S \subseteq F_n$ and $Q(S) = F_n$, then S can only be one of the following two sets:

- $S = \left\{0, 1, \frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{3}, \dots, \frac{1}{n}\right\}$
- $S = \left\{0, 1, \frac{1}{n}, \frac{2}{n}, \dots, \frac{n-1}{n}\right\}$